



SENATE

Draft Minutes of the Meeting held via Microsoft Teams on 21 October 2020

Members:	Abdulraouf Abdussalam	Dr Pam Bagley	Clare Beckett-Wrighton
	Professor Marina Bloj	Dermot Bolton	Dr Peter Branney
	Dr Elaine Brown	Professor Felician Campean	Professor Shirley Congdon (Chair)
	Dr Karina Croucher	Vincent Gaffney	Sarah George
	Professor Alastair Goldman	Professor Anne Graham	Alison Hartley
	Janice High	Chris Kaushall-Bolland	Dr Hatice Kizgin
	Dr Jing Li	Dr William Martin	Ashok Mistry
	Professor Iqbal Mujtaba	Dariya Mykhayliv	Clare Peyton
	Nikki Pierce	Professor Martin Priest	Nilam Prinjha
	Professor Rami Qahwaji	Dr Nejat Rahmanian	Jona Schmidt
	Samera Shabir	Maria Tufail	Professor Vishanth Weerakkody

In attendance: Professor Udy Archibong, Strategic Advisor for EDI
 [REDACTED] Head of Careers and Employability (for items 19, 20, 21)
 Michael Bell, Lay Member of Council
 [REDACTED] RSM
 [REDACTED] Assistant Director, Planning and Performance (for items 17, 18, 19)
 [REDACTED] Assistant Head, Governance (for items 1 – 11)
 Amir Hussain, Lay Member of Council
 Joanne Marshall, Director of People and Campus Services
 Riley Power, University Secretary
 [REDACTED] Assistant Director, Research and Innovation (for items 9, 14, 15)
 [REDACTED] Governance and Projects Officer (for items 12 – 35)
 Paul Watson, Director of Learning Teaching and Student Experience
 Michael Ziff, Lay Member of Council

Apologies: Professor John Bridgeman [REDACTED]
 Professor Zahir Irani [REDACTED]

Note: the names of employees who are not members of the Executive Board and attendees external to the University have been redacted as they are considered to be exempt information as defined by section 40 (2) of the Freedom of Information Act 2000 which covers personal information.

1.20-21 **Chair’s Opening Remarks**

- 1.1 The Chair welcomed new and existing members to their first meeting of the Senate for the academic session 2020/21.
- 1.2 The Chair also welcomed [REDACTED] from RSM who was observing the meeting as part of the internal audit that was being undertaken on academic governance and to three lay governors, Michael Bell, Amir Hussain, and Michael Ziff, who had been invited to observe the meeting to support Council's role in ensuring the effective operation of academic governance and in their understanding of the work of the Senate.

2.20-21 **Minutes of the meeting on 24 June 2020 (Document SEN108/19-21)**

- 2.1 The minutes of the meeting held on the 24 June 2020 were **approved** by circulation prior to the Senate meeting.

3.20-21 **Matters arising and action tracker (Document SEN001/20-21)**

- 3.1 Senate received a report on matters arising from the Senate meeting on 24 June 2020 and the actions taken since that meeting to address them, noting that the Maternity, Paternity and Parent Policy for Students would be presented to the Senate in January, for approval.
- 3.2 **ACTION: present Maternity, Paternity and Parent Policy for Students (with completed EIA) in January 2021 (Academic Registrar)**

4.20-21 **Report from the Chair**

- 4.1 The Chair recorded her continued appreciation to staff and the Students' Union for the work that had been undertaken during the pandemic and in welcoming, supporting and teaching students in the current unprecedented and exceptional times. Senate's role in overseeing the academic activities of the University, and in the approval of the emergency academic regulations was also acknowledged.
- 4.2 The next 'Ask Me Anything' event would take place on 4 November with a focus on COVID-19, test and trace and safety on campus.

5.20-21 **Report on Chair's Actions (Document SEN002/20-21)**

- 5.1 Senate noted the following Chair's actions that had been taken on behalf of Senate:
 - a) **approval** of Honorary Visiting Professor (extension of appointment), FoLS – [REDACTED]
 - b) **approval** of Honorary Visiting Professor renewal (new appointment), FoLS – [REDACTED].
 - c) **approval** of Honorary Professor, FoHS (new appointment) – [REDACTED].
 - d) **approval** of exceptions to the Emergency Academic Regulations and the subsequent **rescinding** of the Emergency Academic Regulations.
 - e) **approval** of the BeOne Foundation Gift Agreement.

- f) **approval** of the outstanding actions which related to the Bradford Academic Career Journey as agreed by Senate in April 2020.

6.20-21 **Declarations of Interest**

- 6.1 No declarations of interest were received in relation to the business of the meeting.

7.20-21 **Student Recruitment Report (Document SEN007/20-21)**

- 7.1 The Vice-Chancellor presented a comprehensive overview of the student recruitment activity and results outlined in the report, noting that the home undergraduate recruitment target had been exceeded; this aligned with the extensive work that had been undertaken to enhance home undergraduate recruitment. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED] Additional January starts for programmes in Management, Law and Social Sciences and Engineering and Informatics would provide opportunities to recruit additional students during the cycle.

Note: part of the above minute has been redacted as it is considered to be exempt information as defined by section 43 (2) of the Freedom of Information Act 2000 which covers commercial interests.

- 7.2 The international market remained challenging, but this had been mitigated by approving the majority of PGT programmes to accept students for a January 2021 start. Faculties were thanked for their agility and flexibility in developing dual intakes.

- 7.3 A brief update on the emerging financial position following enrolment was provided. The continued need for vigilant financial management was noted.

7.4

[REDACTED]

Note: the above minute has been redacted as it is considered to be exempt information as defined by section 43 (2) of the Freedom of Information Act 2000 which covers commercial interests.

7.5 **ACTIONS:**

- **undertake an analysis on conversion rates from online activities and share with Senate for information (PVC, AIQ)**
- **communicate the new student visa route to staff (Academic Registrar)**

8.20-21 **Annual Assurance Report to OfS on Conditions B1-B5 (Document SEN008/20-21)**

8.1 The Director of Learning, Teaching and Quality Enhancement summarised the measures and processes employed to provide assurance that the University's approach to the management of quality and standards remained robust.

8.2 Members considered the report and the following observations were made:

- the University's approach to the monitoring of academic standards and the quality of learning, teaching, and the student experience were being recalibrated to the requirements of the OfS' Regulatory Framework and the emerging approach to compliance assessment.
- that the Learning, Teaching and Student Experience Sub-Strategy (LTSES) provided a structure for this exercise and the overarching timeline for this activity would form part of the LTSES delivery and implementation plan.
- that a key part of the implementation of the LTSES would involve transitioning from a process-driven model of quality assurance to a risk-based and data-informed approach.
- that the new approach would be co-designed with Faculties and Professional Services.
- that it should not be unnecessarily bureaucratic but meaningful and relevant.
- that there were specific aspects of the student experience and certain parts of the portfolio that needed to be enhanced.
- that a coherent internal survey strategy would be developed.
- that the move to an agile data-driven/outcome-led approach required robust mechanisms for analysing and reporting key data sets.
- that LTQE would work with the UBU to ensure student representation in all academic quality and enhancement projects/initiatives.
- that a significant review of the NSS would be undertaken by the OfS. A brief update on the TEF was also provided.

8.3 Noting the importance of the report, Senate **approved** Document SEN008 as assurance:

- of the robustness of the University's current management of quality and standards.
- that the risks associated with the new and emergent regulatory framework, quality assurance regime, and compliance assessment methodology were understood and appropriately mitigated.
- that priority actions had been identified and were appropriate. These would be taken forward in 2020/21 and would ensure the University was able to adjust to the new external regulatory environment whilst supporting its internal strategic objectives.

- 8.4 Senate also **endorsed** the report for consideration by the University Council.
- 8.5 **ACTION: present report to Council in November 2020 (PVC, AIQ)**
- 9.20-21 **Draft Business and Community Engagement Strategy 2020-2025 (Document SEN009/20-21)**
- 9.1 Senate considered the draft Business and Community Engagement Sub-Strategy. The draft, which had been consulted on widely, described a vision in which Bradford would be a university city that shared knowledge in order to strengthen health, wealth and confidence across the many communities in which students, staff and alumni participated.
- 9.2 Points noted in discussion included:
- the commitment of the Executive to strengthening the relationship between the University and civic society.
 - that the strategy would promote and drive economic growth and social inclusion locally, regionally, nationally, and globally.
 - the importance of the University's involvement in current and future strategic planning of the region, for example, engagement with the West Yorkshire Devolution Deal.
 - that the University's strategies would be implemented through the operational plans of Faculties/Directorates and/or through projects. The planning round for 2021/22 would continue the task of converting strategies into actionable plans.
 - that a full EIA would be undertaken once the strategy had been approved.
- 9.3 Senate **welcomed** the draft strategy, noting that a final version would be presented to the Council, for approval. Further views / comments should be forwarded to the Associate Director (Research and Innovation).
- 9.4 **ACTION: present draft BCE strategy to Council in November (PVC, RKT)**
- 10.20-21 **Annual Report of Senate 2019/20 (Document SEN010/20-21)**
- 10.1 Senate received and noted the annual report of the business undertaken by Senate on behalf of Council during 2019/20. It would be presented to the Council as part of the assurance process of the robustness of the University's academic governance arrangements.
- 10.2 **ACTION: present annual report of Senate business to Council in November 2020 (Vice-Chancellor).**
- 11.20-21 **Student Mental Health Strategy Update (Document SEN011/20-21)**
- 11.1 Senate received an update on the development of the Student Mental Health Strategy. The strategy was being designed with students and would be delivered in partnership with the

Students' Union. The University's commitment to supporting the mental health of its students and to promoting an environment which fostered inclusivity, care and wellbeing was strongly welcomed by Senate.

- 11.2 The strategy would be mapped to the UUK's framework (Step Change: Mentally Healthy Universities) and aligned to the recently approved University Strategy, and Learning, Teaching and Student Experience and Equality, Diversity, and Inclusion strategies. There were also opportunities, through partnership working, to link to the Business and Community Engagement Strategy. Further University-wide consultation sessions would be undertaken with staff and students before presentation to the Senate, for approval.
- 11.3 The Academic Registrar also presented a brief overview on the tailored support that was being provided to students who were self-isolating. This included support for mental health and wellbeing and help with food parcels, deliveries, and printing.

11.4 **ACTIONS:**

- **present draft Student Mental Health Strategy to Senate in January 2021 (Academic Registrar)**
- **incorporate relevant elements of the Student Mental Health Strategy into the implementation plan for the LTSE (Director of LTQE / Academic Registrar)**

12.20-21 **Maternity, Paternity and Parent Policy for students (Document SEN012/20-21)**

- 12.1 This item was removed from the agenda and would be presented at the next meeting of Senate in January 2021.

13.20-21 **Lecture Capture Policy (Document SEN013/20-21)**

- 13.1 Senate received a report on the Lecture Capture Policy which outlined the University's approach to the implementation of a lecture capture system, which had been developed to support the trial phase of the introduction of the Echo360 lecture capture system at the University. The policy covered the key aspects of how lecture capture would be used, the rights and responsibilities of those involved.
- 13.2 A meeting was held with the University and College Union (UCU) on 8 October 2020 to discuss the draft of the policy and several questions were raised. An addendum (Document SEN013b refers) was circulated to Senate members which included amendments to the Policy.
- 13.3 Senate discussed the policy and implications of implementation. It was noted that lecture capture was used widely in the sector and was considered good practice to provide lecture capture as part of a broader range of online learning materials.
- 13.4 The policy would be further developed to include the use of other technologies including Zoom and Teams.

13.5 A discussion ensued in relation to:

- Use of lecture recording – clarification was requested on whether the standard performance review process included recordings being used as part of disciplinary and capability processes. It was confirmed that, recordings would not be used for standard performance review but could be used for disciplinary procedures if appropriate. Links to the relevant HR policies would be included with the publishing of this policy;
- Zoom training – it was confirmed that training for staff on Zoom was available as part of a series of training opportunities run by the educational and digital development team;
- Transcripts – there were some concerns that that the requirement to amend transcripts of lecture recording might create capacity or workload pressures. Confirmation was if lecturers were not expected to amend full transcripts but should ensure key technical wording and terminology were correct. This issue would be taken forward as part of the further development work being undertaken.

13.6 Senate **approved** the ‘Echo 30 (lecture Capture policy)’ and the associated EIA and DPIA and noted the policy would be reviewed considering implementation of other learning technology platforms.

13.7 SECRETARY’S NOTE:

In relation to Section 6 of the policy, this paragraph was updated following a question raised by a member of Senate in relation to the references to the library and academic skills offering technological and systems support on Echo360. This had been updated to: ‘students will be able to access technological and systems support from the IT Helpdesk, Student Support Desk, My Bradford, and the IT bar (once commissioned)’.

14.20-21 **KEF Narrative (Document SEN014/20-21)**

14.1 Senate was provided with an overview of the Knowledge Exchange Framework being overseen by Research England, that aimed to increase the efficiency and effectiveness, the use of public funding for knowledge exchange, and further a culture of continuous improvement in Universities.

14.2 The University had submitted three narrative statements under the Knowledge Exchange Framework to Research England to meet the 16 October 2020 deadline. These included how the University carried out knowledge exchange in relation to the Institutional context, local growth and regeneration, and public and community engagement. It was noted that the statements would be evaluated by an independent panel and it was anticipated that constructive feedback would be received over the next few months.

15.20-21 **REF Update (Document SEN015/20-21)**

15.1 Senate noted the progress made by the University in its preparations for the forthcoming submission to the next Research Excellence Framework exercise.

- 15.2 On 19 June 2020, Research England confirmed that following the COVID-19 pandemic the revised deadline for submission would be 31 March 2021. The staff census date of 31 July 2020 remained in place.
- 15.3 Senate was assured that progress remained on track with plans for submission to the eight Units of Assessment.
- 15.4 The importance of REF was noted in terms of the quality of outputs, and its use to determine allocation of funding for research, and Senate note the subsequent work to be carried out in preparation for the March deadline.

16.20-21 **Update on Student Complaints Related to COVID-19 Pandemic (Document SEN016/20-21)**

- 16.1 Senate was provided with an update on the approach taken by the University in relation to complaints received during the COVID-19 pandemic. The Executive Board agreed that the University would use its standard complaints procedure, with a more structured approach for the early resolution stage to include written correspondence being sent to students setting out the measures being taken to support students, to ensure a consistent approach.
- 16.2 The University to date, had received 28 individual complaints which referenced COVID-19. Seven of these complaints related to a specific module from the Faculty of Engineering and Informatics with a caveat related to COVID-19, so these were not considered appropriate to take through the early resolution stage. 16 complaints had been considered through the formal process, and from these 16 only 2 had progressed to the review stage. Two complaints had been agreed as ineligible for consideration, as they related to students in financial hardship and did not constitute a complaint. It was noted that several other universities had reported significantly higher numbers of student complaints.
- 16.3 It was noted that to date no complaints had been escalated to the OIA as none had reached the stage of completion of procedures letters being issued.

17.20-21 **League Table and Rankings (Document SEN017/20-21)**

- 17.1 Senate was provided with a report from the Associate Director, Planning and Performance on the results from the following three rankings: The QS World University Rankings, The Guardian University Guide (GUG) and The Times Good University Guide.
- 17.2 The University had seen a marginal improvement in performance in the QS international table, however the other two UK rankings had experienced a decline in performance. The changes in the data used for these had affected the University's performance.
- 17.3 Senate was asked to note the continuation of work aiming to improve our performance across each of these measures through the Sub-Strategies. In addition to this there were specific actions in response to the NSS results, initiatives relating to International Recruitment and the Access and Participation, and further development of the enabling strategies.

18.20-21 **National Student Survey (NSS) 2020 Results (Document SEN018/20-21)**

- 18.1 Senate received an overview of the NSS results from the Associate Director, Planning and Performance. The University had improved on all categories in comparison to scores in 2018 and 2019, against the decline across the sector in all the question groups, although the University was still behind the sector average in a number of categories.
- 18.2 A detailed breakdown of the results was discussed, including an explanation of the variances from previous years and sector benchmarks, in addition to outlier results.
- 18.3 The Director of Learning, Teaching and Quality Enhancement noted that meetings had been undertaken with Deans and Associate Dean's to understand the narratives behind the results and the data would be grouped with the programme outcome data around annual monitoring and how they related. The next series of meetings with faculties would bring data together and start action planning based on these dialogues, rather than waiting for annual monitoring data before undertaking any action.
- 18.4 Senate **endorsed** the response from Executive Board which focused on changes to the Annual Monitoring process to:
- Schedule 'student experience' meetings with Deans to review NSS data and comments.
 - Repurpose and schedule annual monitoring for increased focus on data.
 - Direct resource more effectively - prioritising and supporting poorly performing areas.
 - Share and learn from best practice across programme through the annual monitoring process.
 - Introduce KPIs to support the University's Sub and Enabling Strategies that would better monitor performance and provide a more direct link between strategy and PDR.

19.20-21 **Longitudinal Education Outcomes (Document SEN019/20-21)**

- 19.1 The Head of Careers and Employability presented the Longitudinal Educational Outcomes (LEO) report published by the DfE, which measured graduate outcomes using earnings and benefits data from tax records for 2017-2018 for UK undergraduate students. This was the fourth year of using this data set and an analysis of the University's performance produced by Planning and Performance was discussed.
- 19.2 The following points were highlighted in comparison to regional and UK figures:
- A slightly higher percentage of activity not being captured was recorded over the five-year period;
 - Earnings had risen over this period but not at the same rate as the region and UK average;
 - A slightly higher percentage of University students not in employment or further study.
- 19.3 Overall data suggested that salaries were lower in the Yorkshire and Humber than the rest of the UK, and specifically salary levels in Bradford were lower than in Yorkshire and

Humber. This impacted on the University dataset given that around 33% of University students remained in Bradford following graduation.

19.4 Senate was advised that datasets from DfE did not consider any regional differences in terms of salaries. The University was strongest in terms of salaries in the areas of Allied Health, Biosciences and Medical Sciences. Highlighting that structural inequalities in the labour market were prevalent with males earning more than females, younger graduates earning more than mature graduates, A-level students on higher salaries than those with BTECs, higher socio-economic backgrounds earning more than lower socio-economic backgrounds, and some subjects having considerable more earning power than others.

19.5 The University continued to work closely with local counsellors and MP's in Bradford, being involved with economic recovery work, and contributing to developments where possible.

20.20-21 **Graduate outcome Survey report 2017-18 (Document SEN020/20-21)**

20.1 The Head of Careers and Employment presented a report on the first HESA graduate outcomes survey. The survey focused on UK graduate fulltime students. It was highlighted that HESA had encountered several issues which resulted in a delay in the report. This report presented the statistics from the 2017-18 core data release. It was noted that the time lag of the survey period of 15 months from the completion of studies, to the reporting of outcomes was almost two years.

20.2 A detailed breakdown of the results was discussed, including an explanation of the variances from previous years and sector benchmarks. It was highlighted that over the last 8-9 years, the University had experienced a positive trajectory with the DLHE data, and performance with this survey was not as strong. Overall, the University had achieved variable performance.

20.3 In relation to salaries, due to the low response rates it was difficult to analyse the data at programme level and it was noted that this would impact on the data available for inclusion in the prospectus. At sector level, 21% of those graduates in full time paid employment earned a salary in the band £24,000-26999, by comparison the University had 20% which was close to the average.

20.4 A discussion was held on the reasons for the overall low response rates to the survey, noting the changes in HESA operating the call centres rather than contact with the students being made directly from the University. The importance of raising awareness of the graduate surveys whilst students were at the University during their studies to promote the importance and purpose of the survey was noted.

20.5 It was noted that the results had gone to faculties and key actions had been recommended to address the University's performance and were set out in the following report SEN021/20-21.

21.20-21 **Graduate outcome key actions report (Document SEN021/20-21)**

21.1 Senate received a report on the key actions to be implemented following the outcomes set out in the HESA Graduate outcomes survey report.

21.2 Following consideration of the LEO report (SEN019/20-21) and Graduate Outcome report (SEN020/20-21), 11 actions were identified to be introduced in the current academic year 2020-21, to address the four key challenges to improve future graduate progression performance. These actions had been agreed with the Deans and Associate Deans and would be aligned with the Learning, Teaching and Student Experience Strategy. These included:

- Survey response rates;
- Unemployment of graduates;
- Low or medium skilled employment following graduation;
- Salary levels.

21.3 Executive Board had approved 10 of the 11 actions (actions 1-8, and 10-11) recommended at its meeting on 20 October 2020. Action 9 required additional funding in anticipation of the increased capacity of unemployment and additional support required to graduates given the current labour market challenges and expected impact on unemployment given the current economic changes. The budgeting round had already been set for 2020-21 and therefore any requests would need to be considered as part of the 'gathered field' approval process.

21.4 A discussion took place on the importance of cross faculty approaches to careers pathways. The vast majority of students progressed in to expected careers, however a number of students moved into other subject areas when gaining employment. Advertisements would be used to encourage students to think more broadly about their future career options, given that 60% of graduate employment was open to students to apply from any discipline.

22.20-21 **Research Degrees Sub-Committee 2019-2020 Review (Document SEN022/20-21)**

22.1 Senate received a report on the one-year review undertaken following the implementation of the revised Research Degrees Sub-Committee in 2019-20. It was noted that the Sub-Committee had met on five occasions, and the establishment of this Committee to oversee matters relating to postgraduate research had enabled the time and space to discuss the postgraduate developments and provided a more consistent approach to overseeing postgraduate research.

23.20-21 **Application for Honorary Visiting Professor (Document SEN023/2020-21)**

23.1 Senate considered and **approved** an application for an extension of the Honorary Visiting Professor appointment for ██████████ in the Faculty of Engineering and Informatics for a period of three years.

24.20-21 **HVP Extension (Document SEN024/20-21)**

24.1 Senate considered and **approved** an application for an extension of the Emeritus Professor appointment for [REDACTED] in the Faculty of Management, Law and Social Sciences for a period of three years.

25.20-21 **Access and Participation Plan update (Document SEN025/20-21)**

25.1 Senate received an update on the work that had been undertaken to deliver the University's Access and Participation Plan and noted the 15 workstreams continued to make good progress. Specifically noting progress made in the areas of Collaborative Outreach, Decolonising the Curriculum, and Role Models.

26.20-21 **Prevent update (Document SEN026/20-21)**

26.1 Senate were provided with an update on the University's implementation of the Prevent Duty during the COVID-19 pandemic.

26.2 It was reported that the OfS had reviewed the requirements for the Annual Accountability and Data Return and noted the removal of the requirement to report on the number of welfare cases within the University. A narrative on the steps taken to support student welfare and compliance with Prevent duty during the pandemic was required. This would be presented to Council in November before submission to the OfS to meet the 1 December 2020 deadline.

27.20-21 **Honorary Degrees Committee (Document SEN027/20-21)**

27.1 Senate considered the recommendation to confer one Honorary Award for [REDACTED] – Doctor of the University as recommended by the Joint Committee of Senate and Council on Honorary Degrees at its meeting held on 28 September 2020.

27.2 Senate also noted the other matters set out in the summary report presented to the Senate.

27.3 Senate **recommended** to Council the approval of the candidate for an Honorary Award.

28.20-21 **Learning and Teaching Committee (Document SEN028/20-21)**

28.1 Senate received the report from the Learning and Teaching Committee held on 17 September 2020.

29.20-21 **Research and Knowledge Transfer Strategy Committees (June and Sept) (Document SEN029/20-21)**

29.1 Senate received the report from the Research and Knowledge Transfer Strategy Committees held on 18 May and 21 September 2020.

30.20-21 **Management, Law and Social Sciences (Document SEN030/20-21)**

30.1 Senate received and noted the report from the Faculty of Management, Law and Social Sciences Faculty Board held on 23 September 2020.

31.20-21 **Engineering and Informatics (Document SEN031/20-21)**

31.1 Senate received and noted the report from the Faculty of Engineering and Informatics Faculty Board held on 23 September 2020.

32.20-21 **Health Studies (Document SEN032/20-21)**

32.1 Senate received and noted the report from the Faculty of Health Studies Faculty Boards held on 18 June and 16 September 2020.

33.20-21 **Draft agenda for 27 January 2021 (Document SEN033/20-21)**

33.1 Senate received and noted the report.

34.20-21 **Schedule of Business 2020-21 (Document SEN033/20-21)**

34.1 Senate received and noted the report.

35.20-21 **Terms of reference and membership 2020-21 (Document SEN035/20-21)**

35.1 Senate received and noted the report.

Secretary: Jacqui Holgate and Rachel Trawally, Governance Team

Date: November 2020